## RE: FW: EPA comments on 2012 Draft IR - request for Kenai River turbidity data

Jill Gable to: Gilder, Cindy J (DEC)

09/11/2012 04:32 PM

Cc: "Grant, Drew (DEC)", "Stevens, Timothy S (DEC)"

Hi Cindy,

Whatever/whenever you think makes sense is fine, I'll just need all of it before I make an approval/disapproval decision after your final list has been submitted. If you want to provide all of it before that so I can start taking a look, that's great, if you'd rather wait until the final is submitted, that's fine too. I will just need it all when determining if we agree with the decision not to list (or lack of decision to list???, however you want to look at it.) Thanks.

jill

Jill Gable, Watershed Unit US EPA, Region 10 1200 Sixth Ave., Suite 900 (OWW-134) Seattle, WA 98101-3140 (206) 553-2582, (206) 553-0165 (fax) gable.jill@epa.gov

"Gilder, Cindy J (DEC)" First, Jill, this is more of a non-decision tha... 09/11/2012 03:19:14 PM

From: "Gilder, Cindy J (DEC)" <cindy.gilder@alaska.gov>

To: Jill Gable/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, "Stevens, Timothy S (DEC)" <tim.stevens@alaska.gov>

Cc: "Grant, Drew (DEC)" <drew.grant@alaska.gov>

Date: 09/11/2012 03:19 PM

Subject: RE: FW: EPA comments on 2012 Draft IR - request for Kenai River turbidity data

First, Jill, this is more of a non-decision than a decision. Remember, although we got a report the end of June we are expecting an addendum to that report in the next few weeks. As Tim discussed below, the peer reviewers did look at things like how outliers were handled (an important component of any QA process), I am not sure if they actually looked at the over 50,000 raw data points that we can supply.

As I mentioned on the phone, the addendum is a result of Tim looking at the data and the report and finding a problem which is being corrected. I think to have things make more sense, it is prudent for us to send the data with the report and addendum

**From:** Jill Gable [mailto:Gable.Jill@epamail.epa.gov]

Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2012 2:05 PM

**To:** Stevens, Timothy S (DEC)

Cc: Gilder, Cindy J (DEC); Grant, Drew (DEC)

Subject: RE: FW: EPA comments on 2012 Draft IR - request for Kenai River turbidity data

Hi Tim,

Thanks for letting me know. So I guess then I need the data (which Drew is sending), the report (is that included with the raw data?) and the peer review of the report. Is there anything else that would have been taken into account when making the listing decision? If so, I'll take that too. Thanks everyone.

jill

Jill Gable, Watershed Unit US EPA, Region 10 1200 Sixth Ave., Suite 900 (OWW-134) Seattle, WA 98101-3140 (206) 553-2582, (206) 553-0165 (fax) gable\_iill@epa.gov

"Stevens, Timothy S (DEC)" ---09/11/2012 02:55:32 PM---Jill, I will verify with our contractor that over saw the peer review, but I believe the peer review

From: "Stevens, Timothy S (DEC)" < tim.stevens@alaska.gov >

To: Jill Gable/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, "Grant, Drew (DEC)" < drew.grant@alaska.gov>

Cc: "Gilder, Cindy J (DEC)" < cindy.gilder@alaska.gov >

Date: 09/11/2012 02:55 PM

Subject: RE: FW: EPA comments on 2012 Draft IR - request for Kenai River turbidity data

Jill,

I will verify with our contractor that over saw the peer review, but I believe the peer review was just on the information contained in the report and did not include a review of the data itself. With that said, reviewers did have an opportunity to address the methodology used to determine data outliers.

Timothy Stevens, Project Manager DEC/DOW/NPS 555 Cordova Street Anchorage, Alaska 99501 ph: 907-269-7515

Fax: 907-334-2415 tim.stevens@alaska.gov

From: Jill Gable [mailto:Gable.Jill@epamail.epa.gov]

Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2012 1:51 PM

To: Grant, Drew (DEC)

Cc: Gilder, Cindy J (DEC); Stevens, Timothy S (DEC)

Subject: RE: FW: EPA comments on 2012 Draft IR - request for Kenai River turbidity data

Thank you!

Jill Gable, Watershed Unit
US EPA, Region 10
1200 Sixth Ave., Suite 900 (OWW-134)
Seattle, WA 98101-3140
(206) 553-2582, (206) 553-0165 (fax)
gable.jill@epa.gov

"Grant, Drew (DEC)" ---09/11/2012 02:41:15 PM---Right, understood Jill - -we are looking into that.

From: "Grant, Drew (DEC)" <drew.grant@alaska.gov>

To: Jill Gable/R10/USEPA/US@EPA

Cc: "Gilder, Cindy J (DEC)" <cindy.gilder@alaska.gov>, "Stevens, Timothy S (DEC)" <tim.stevens@alaska.gov>

Date: 09/11/2012 02:41 PM

Subject: RE: FW: EPA comments on 2012 Draft IR - request for Kenai River turbidity data

Right, understood Jill - -we are looking into that. drew

From: Jill Gable [mailto:Gable.Jill@epamail.epa.gov]

Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2012 1:40 PM

**To:** Grant, Drew (DEC)

Cc: Gilder, Cindy J (DEC); Stevens, Timothy S (DEC)

Subject: Re: FW: EPA comments on 2012 Draft IR - request for Kenai River turbidity data

Thanks Tim and Drew. If/when possible, we would also like to take a look at the peer review of the data, as I assume that did, or in the future will, play a role in a listing decision. Thanks.

jill

Jill Gable, Watershed Unit US EPA, Region 10 1200 Sixth Ave., Suite 900 (OWW-134) Seattle, WA 98101-3140 (206) 553-2582, (206) 553-0165 (fax) gable.jill@epa.gov

"Grant, Drew (DEC)" ---09/11/2012 02:28:57 PM---Jill - - As EPA has requested - Thanks to Tim I have copied this data over to disk and will getting

From: "Grant, Drew (DEC)" < <a href="mailto:drew.grant@alaska.gov">drew.grant@alaska.gov</a>>

To: Jill Gable/R10/USEPA/US@EPA

Cc: "Gilder, Cindy J (DEC)" <cindy.gilder@alaska.gov>, "Stevens, Timothy S (DEC)" <tim.stevens@alaska.gov>

Date: 09/11/2012 02:28 PM

Subject: FW: EPA comments on 2012 Draft IR - request for Kenai River turbidity data

Jill - - As EPA has requested – Thanks to Tim I have copied this data over to disk and will getting it in the mail for you.

Please see Tim's note below on this.

drew

**From:** Stevens, Timothy S (DEC)

Sent: Friday, September 07, 2012 3:13 PM

**To:** Grant, Drew (DEC) **Cc:** Gilder, Cindy J (DEC)

Subject: RE: EPA comments on 2012 Draft IR - request for Kenai River turbidity data

Drew,

In response to EPA comments on the 2012 IR I have created a folder containing all the raw Kenai River turbidity data collected during the 2008-2010 time period. The turbidity data can be found in the following folder on the statewide S drive:

\\\\An-svrfile\\\groups\\\Water\\\WQ\\\NPS\\\Waterbodies\\Kenai\\ River\\\Turbidity\\EPA submittals\_2012 IR

The files in this folder contain all the raw turbidity data collected by the KWF either under contract or grant during the 2008-2010 time period. The actual raw files we received from KWF contain other WQ parameters in addition to turbidity - the other WQ parameter data were removed. No turbidity data points have been removed (contains all turbidity data including outliers).

## Tim

From: Grant, Drew (DEC)

Sent: Friday, September 07, 2012 12:07 PM

**To:** Stevens, Timothy S (DEC); Eldred, Laura K (DEC)

Cc: Gilder, Cindy J (DEC)

**Subject:** FW: EPA comments on 2012 Draft IR

FYI

From: Jill Gable [mailto:Gable.Jill@epamail.epa.gov]

Sent: Friday, September 07, 2012 11:59 AM

**To:** Grant, Drew (DEC)

Cc: Gilder, Cindy J (DEC); Sonafrank, Nancy B (DEC)

Subject: EPA comments on 2012 Draft IR

Hi Drew,

Here are EPA's comments. Thanks so much.

jill

(See attached file: EPA Comment Letter AK Draft 2012 IR.pdf) (See attached file: EPA comment enclosure for AK 2012 draft IR.docx)

Jill Gable, Watershed Unit US EPA, Region 10 1200 Sixth Ave., Suite 900 (OWW-134) Seattle, WA 98101-3140 (206) 553-2582, (206) 553-0165 (fax) gable.jill@epa.gov